

# City of Phoenix

*Meeting Location:  
City Council Chambers  
200 W. Jefferson St.  
Phoenix, Arizona 85003*



**City of Phoenix**

## **Agenda**

**Tuesday, October 22, 2024**

**2:30 PM**

**phoenix.gov**

**City Council Policy Session**

**If viewing this packet electronically in PDF, open and use bookmarks to navigate easily from one item to another.**

## OPTIONS TO ACCESS THIS MEETING

Virtual Request to speak at a meeting:

- Register online by visiting the City Council Meetings page on phoenix.gov at least 2 hours prior to the start of this meeting. Then, click on this link at the time of the meeting and join the Webex to speak:

<https://phoenixcitycouncil.webex.com/phoenixcitycouncil/onstage/g.php?MTID=ef948611cb4b46454c9dafc932da68920>

- Register via telephone at 602-262-6001 at least 2 hours prior to the start of this meeting, noting the item number. Then, use the Call-in phone number and Meeting ID listed below at the time of the meeting to call-in and speak.

In-Person Requests to speak at a meeting:

- Register in person at a kiosk located at the City Council Chambers, 200 W. Jefferson St., Phoenix, Arizona, 85003. Arrive 1 hour prior to the start of this meeting. Depending on seating availability, residents will attend and speak from the Upper Chambers, Lower Chambers or City Hall location.

- Individuals should arrive early, 1 hour prior to the start of the meeting to submit an in-person request to speak before the item is called. After the item is called, requests to speak for that item will not be accepted.

At the time of the meeting:

- Watch the meeting live streamed on phoenix.gov or Phoenix Channel 11 on Cox Cable, or using the Webex link provided above.

- Call-in to listen to the meeting. Dial 602-666-0783 and Enter Meeting ID 2555 757 2841# (for English) or 2554 330 2425# (for Spanish). Press # again when prompted for attendee ID.

- Watch the meeting in-person from the Upper Chambers, Lower Chambers or City Hall depending on seating availability.

- Members of the public may attend this meeting in person. Physical access to the meeting location will be available starting 1 hour prior to the meeting.

Para nuestros residentes de habla hispana:

- Para registrarse para hablar en español, llame al 602-262-6001 al menos 2 horas antes del inicio de esta reunión e indique el número del tema. El día de la reunión, llame al 602-666-0783 e ingrese el número de identificación de la reunión 2554 330 2425#. El intérprete le indicará cuando sea su turno de hablar.

- Para solamente escuchar la reunión en español, llame a este mismo número el día de la reunión (602-666-0783; ingrese el número de identificación de la reunión 2554 330 2425#). Se proporciona interpretación simultánea para nuestros residentes durante todas las reuniones.

- Para asistir a la reunión en persona, vaya a las Cámaras del Concejo Municipal de Phoenix ubicadas en 200 W. Jefferson Street, Phoenix, AZ 85003. Llegue 1 hora antes del comienzo de la reunión. Si desea hablar, regístrese electrónicamente en uno de los quioscos, antes de que comience el tema. Una vez que se comience a discutir el tema, no se aceptarán nuevas solicitudes para hablar. Dependiendo de cuantos asientos haya disponibles, usted podría ser sentado en la parte superior de las cámaras, en el piso de abajo de las cámaras, o en el edificio municipal.

- Miembros del público pueden asistir a esta reunión en persona. El acceso físico al lugar de la reunión estará disponible comenzando una hora antes de la reunión.

### **CALL TO ORDER**

### **COUNCIL INFORMATION AND FOLLOW-UP REQUESTS**

This item is scheduled to give City Council members an opportunity to publicly request information or follow up on issues of interest to the community. If the information is available, staff will immediately provide it to the City Council member. No decisions will be made or action taken.

### **CONSENT ACTION**

This item is scheduled to allow the City Council to act on the Mayor's recommendations on the Consent Agenda. There is no Consent Agenda for this meeting.

**CALL FOR AN EXECUTIVE SESSION**

A vote may be held to call an Executive Session for a future date.

**REPORTS AND BUDGET UPDATES BY THE CITY MANAGER**

This item is scheduled to allow the City Manager to provide brief informational reports on topics of interest to the City Council. The City Council may discuss these reports but no action will be taken.

**INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION (ITEM 1)**

**1 Phoenix Police Department Reserve Division Update Page 5**

This report provides an update to the City Council on the current status of the Phoenix Police Department's Reserve Division.

**THIS ITEM IS FOR INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION.**

**Responsible Department**

This item is submitted by Assistant City Manager Lori Bays and the Police Department.

**DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION (ITEM 2)**

**2 Automated Enforcement Safety Program Page 7**

This report provides information on a potential Automated Enforcement Safety Program.

**THIS ITEM IS FOR DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION.**

**Responsible Department**

This item is submitted by Deputy City Manager Inger Erickson and Street Transportation Department.

**ADJOURN**



---

## Phoenix Police Department Reserve Division Update

This report provides an update to the City Council on the current status of the Phoenix Police Department's Reserve Division.

### **THIS ITEM IS FOR INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION.**

#### **Summary**

The Police Department's Reserve Division continues to be a valuable asset and support to the Department's mission. Currently there are 138 reserve police officers. Many of these women and men have full-time careers, and also volunteer as part-time reserve police officers with the Police Department. These reserve officers are full-authority, sworn police officers certified by Arizona Peace Officer Standards and Training Board (AZPOST). Reserve officers have satisfied the same rigorous hiring and training standards as career police officers.

A significant number of reserve officers are assigned to patrol precincts, where they respond to numerous calls for service each year as independently functioning police officers. These reserve officers work seamlessly with their career counterparts, and residents are unaware that they are being served by volunteers. Other reserve officers work in specialty assignments to include detectives, solo motorcycle officers, airport officers, training officers, transit officers, school safety officers, community relations officers, homeland defense officers and other work units.

In many cases, after serving long careers, some retiring officers and investigators opt to transition to reserve officer status. This transition allows the Police Department the opportunity to retain their valuable skills and experience acquired over many years of service.

Collectively, reserve officers are highly committed and dedicated to the community they serve. Several officers have a combined service of 40 or more years. Some officers have donated, individually, more than 25,000 hours of police services. For Fiscal Year 2023-24, reserve officers donated 42,316 hours of police services with an estimated value of \$5,331,600 to the City. In addition to the financial benefits, the officers in the Reserve Division have become a consistent and relied upon force to

support major special events such as the WNBA All Star Game, the NCAA Final Four events, World Series playoffs and the Super Bowl. In 2023 reserve officers worked 95 separate special events. Currently, the officers are called upon to support last minute staffing needs for visits during this political election season.

The Reserve Division has its own stand-alone police academy. This academy is one of 16 AZPOST accredited training academies in the State of Arizona. Reserve recruits attend this academy every Wednesday and Thursday evening and all day Saturdays for 11 months, receiving the exact training as their career peers. On September 19, 2024, the Department graduated a reserve class with six newly certified officers.

Reserve officers have earned the support and appreciation of the Phoenix business community. The Phoenix Police Reserve Foundation, a 501c3 non-profit charitable organization was established in 2007 by civic and business leaders with the support of City leadership. The Reserve Foundation is directed by an independent Board of Directors, which works closely with police management. The mission of the Reserve Foundation is to support the recruitment, training, equipment and operational needs of reserve officers that are not satisfied by the regular City budget.

The Reserve Foundation has become a model for the creation of other charitable foundations around the country which support reserve police organizations in other jurisdictions. The Reserve Foundation continues to host events such as the “Day at the Police Academy” and “Day at the Driving Track” events attended by business, civic and community leaders who learn about the work performed by reserve police officers. These leaders are exposed to aspects of police training that both our reserve and career police officers receive during their academy training. The Foundation continues to support needs of reserve officers. This past year, the Foundation purchased two new Ford trucks to be used by our reserve detectives, created a program where they supplemented the City's funds for reserve officers' purchase of ballistic vests, provided training supplies and equipment for reserve recruit officers and a scholarship program for those who may need special assistance while attending the reserve academy.

### **Responsible Department**

This item is submitted by Assistant City Manager Lori Bays and the Police Department.



## Automated Enforcement Safety Program

This report provides information on a potential Automated Enforcement Safety Program.

### **THIS ITEM IS FOR DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION.**

#### **Summary**

The City of Phoenix previously managed an Automated Enforcement Safety Program (Program) that started in 2001 with 10 intersections equipped with red-light cameras and two mobile speed vehicles used in 15 mile per hour (mph) school zones. The intent of the Program was to deter red-light violations, reduce speeding violations, and reduce crash frequency and severity. Over the next 18 years, the City held contracts with Lockheed Martin (later becoming Affiliated Computer Systems), American Traffic Solutions, and Redflex Traffic Systems that provided equipment, maintenance, and other services in support of the Program.

At the end of the final contract expiration, the Program included 12 fixed red-light cameras at 12 intersection approaches and a total of eight mobile speed vehicles for specific use in 15 mph school zones and other pedestrian crossing points near schools. The Program was administered by the Phoenix Police Department with support from the Municipal Court and the Street Transportation Department.

In its last full fiscal year (FY) of existence (FY 2018-19), the Program generated approximately \$1.3 million in gross revenue from citations. From this gross revenue, the City paid the vendor \$31.85 per adjudicated citation. The remaining revenue was sufficient to cover Program costs, including City staff in the Phoenix Police Department (2.0 full-time equivalent staff) and Municipal Court (3.5 full-time equivalent staff). After the vendor payments and staff costs, the net program revenue for that fiscal year was approximately \$57,000, while the five-year average net annual revenue was approximately \$28,000.

#### Program Elements

It is an undeniable fact that speeding and red light running (RLR) cause thousands of unnecessary deaths each year in the U.S. Similar to cities across the nation, RLR-

related violations in the Phoenix metropolitan area have become one of the most severe causes of fatal crashes, with 132 fatalities and 6,698 injuries reported from 2017 to 2023. In 2023 alone, the City saw 20 fatalities and 810 injuries.

The use of technology as a tool that can automate enforcement has been deployed in other cities throughout the country. The goal of any automated enforcement safety program should be to modify driver behavior through voluntary compliance of traffic laws. A successful program will see reductions in speeding and RLR behavior, resulting in fewer RLR crashes and serious or fatal injury crashes. The Automated Enforcement Safety Program would complement and supplement traffic enforcement efforts by Phoenix police officers in the Traffic Bureau. In addition, the Program would be complemented by implementation of other Vision Zero strategies such as yellow light timing, leading pedestrian intervals, access management, and pedestrian-related infrastructure improvements.

### *Equipment Options*

The most common devices used in automated enforcement systems employ high-resolution digital cameras to capture driving infractions for RLR and speeding. Each of the options described below employ a two-camera system to capture any infractions.

- **Red Light Running:** The camera is activated by sensors, which are located just prior to the intersection and also in the intersection. The sensors are only activated when a vehicle is detected entering the intersection after the traffic light has turned red. Three images are captured: one prior to entering the intersection, a second within the intersection, and a third departing the intersection. Multiple images are taken to clearly identify the driver and the vehicle's license plate. It is possible to set a short grace or amnesty period before the camera is activated. In the Phoenix metro area, the grace period is typically 0.1 seconds. This means the camera would not activate if a driver ran the red light between 0.0 seconds and 0.1 seconds.
- **Portable Speed Towers/Mobile Speed Vehicles:** These devices may be transported and placed adjacent to the roadway to monitor the speed of approaching vehicles. The cameras are activated when a vehicle exceeds a set threshold speed as it passes by the tower/vehicle and takes multiple images to clearly identify the driver and the vehicle's license plate. These devices are often used in school zones, but may be used anywhere adjacent to the roadway.
- **Speed on Green:** The camera system mounted at the intersection approach is activated when a vehicle exceeds a set threshold speed as it passes through the intersection. Again, multiple images are captured to clearly identify the driver and the vehicle's license plate. This device will also enforce speeding through the intersection on yellow and red lights as well.
- **Fixed Mid-Block Speed:** These devices are permanently mounted mid-block, along



a roadway segment not at the intersection, on poles to monitor the speed of each passing vehicle. When the device detects a vehicle exceeding a set threshold speed, the camera system is activated to capture the event, including multiple images to clearly identify the driver and the vehicle's license plate.

### *Pricing Models*

The automated enforcement industry typically has three pricing models for vendors to provide their services. In each model below, the contracted vendor would supply, install, and maintain the devices in the field as well as provide processing services.

- Revenue Share: There are no city expenditures for equipment, installation, maintenance, or other provided vendor services. The split of citation revenue between the municipality and the vendor is negotiated.
- Subscription: The city pays a flat lease fee for equipment, maintenance, and vendor -provided services, but the city retains all citation revenue.
- Hybrid: Like the subscription model, but the city pays a lower lease fee and pays the vendor a nominal fee per adjudicated citation. This fee in local contracts has typically been between \$20 and \$45 per citation.

Even after revenues stabilize, many programs across the country earn a positive net revenue. If the Program is renewed in Phoenix, staff recommends any net revenue realized from the Program be reinvested in traffic safety programs or projects aimed at quicker implementation of the City's Vision Zero Road Safety Action Plan.

### *Site Selection Criteria*

There is no national standard or consistent methodology that cities use for selecting automated enforcement locations. The *Speed Enforcement Camera Systems Operational Guidelines* developed in 2008 by the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration describe crash history as a primary factor that should be considered for location selection.

The methodology of determining red-light camera locations would use the most recent three years of data supplied by the Arizona Department of Transportation and to isolate angle crashes. In addition, criteria would also factor in crashes with serious and fatal injuries due to RLR violations and crashes involving pedestrians at the signalized intersections where the driver was found to be at fault. Street Transportation Department staff would also evaluate each potential location to determine if other factors, such as available right-of-way, utility conflicts, current and upcoming construction projects, and jurisdictional considerations might make installation of a red-light camera at a particular intersection not feasible.

The methodology for the placement of portable speed towers and mobile speed vehicles would include reviewing crash data for corridors that have high incidences of speeding-related crashes, known high-speeding areas identified by the Phoenix Police Department's Traffic Bureau, and within school zones. Given the portability, these devices can also be rotated in various areas throughout the City to cover a variety of needs.

### Recommendation

Staff requests input from the City Council regarding the recommendation for a potential Automated Enforcement Safety Program with the following components:

- Issue a Request for Proposals by Spring 2025 for RLR cameras, portable speed towers, and mobile speed vehicles. Additional services such as the Speed on Green and Fixed Mid-block cameras could be included in the contract for future consideration. The City would have the sole responsibility and authority in the selection of locations. The hybrid pricing model is recommended as it seems to be the most widely used pricing model that includes a monthly maintenance and operation fee per location as well as a nominal fee per adjudicated citation.
- Implementation of a RLR enforcement program. The RLR program is to be managed with fixed cameras at intersections where current data has shown high numbers of angle crashes, focusing on those with the highest number of serious and fatal injuries. It is recommended that up to 10 RLR cameras be installed in the first year based on the current crash data. The Street Transportation Department would ensure that all 10 RLR camera locations have implemented the extended yellow light timing at the intersections.
- Implementation of the portable and mobile speed enforcement program. Cameras can be used at mid-block locations on a roadway segment where data may show excessive speeding in between intersections and can also be placed in school zones. It is recommended that up to six portable cameras be implemented in the first year based on current data or in school zones. The speed enforcement program can be set concurrently with the RLR enforcement program and can rotate throughout the City with a focus on data driven locations.
- Implementation of a minimum 30-day warning period where warning notices would be sent in lieu of citations. A warning period would be at the onset of the Program for both RLR and speed enforcement cameras and throughout the program when new RLR camera locations are added. Based on data from the previous Program, the City would have to cover the costs during the warning period, which is estimated to be \$10,000 per 30-day period per camera location.
- Implementation of a Public Information Campaign to inform the public about the Program, which would include at a minimum a website, press releases, media coverage, social media posts, and public service announcements.

- The Street Transportation and the Phoenix Police departments would conduct an annual review of the most recent crash data and develop a report on the performance of the Program as well as propose potential new red-light camera locations and possible expansion of the speed enforcement program. This report could be provided to Council for review and approval annually.

#### Implementation Timeline

Staff anticipates that the potential Automated Enforcement Safety Program could be operational no later than Fall 2025 based on the recommended 10 RLR cameras and six portable speed enforcement cameras. Additional staff may be needed in the Street Transportation Department, Phoenix Police Department, and/or Municipal Court if additional cameras are requested. Typically, one Phoenix Police Department staff person is needed for up to six camera locations for review of the citations.

#### **Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

This item was presented to the Transportation, Infrastructure, and Planning Subcommittee on October 18, 2023.

#### **Responsible Department**

This item is submitted by Deputy City Manager Inger Erickson and Street Transportation Department.