



City of Phoenix

Meeting Location:
City Council Chambers
200 W. Jefferson St.
Phoenix, Arizona 85003

Minutes

City Council Policy Session

Tuesday, May 18, 2021

2:30 PM

phoenix.gov

CALL TO ORDER

The Phoenix City Council convened in Policy Session on Tuesday May, 18, 2021 at 2:34 p.m. in the Council Chambers.

Present: 9 - Councilwoman Yassamin Ansari, Councilman Sal DiCiccio, Councilwoman Betty Guardado, Councilwoman Ann O'Brien, Councilwoman Laura Pastor, Councilwoman Debra Stark, Councilman Jim Waring, Vice Mayor Carlos Garcia and Mayor Kate Gallego

Councilwoman Pastor joined the meeting at 2:48 p.m. and left at 2:54 p.m. She returned at 4:18 p.m. and left at 6:54 p.m.

Councilman DiCiccio left the meeting at 7:00 p.m.

COUNCIL INFORMATION AND FOLLOW-UP REQUESTS

Councilwoman Ansari thanked everyone who helped promote and vaccinate 650 people in District 7 at Cesar Chavez Park on May 15.

Councilwoman Guardado reminded residents about the vaccine event on May 19 at St. Vincent de Paul Church and thanked everyone for their efforts.

Vice Mayor Garcia requested an update on the heat respite center.

City Manager Ed Zuercher stated the heat respite program was utilizing a temporary structure with existing resources and American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA) funds could be used to create a permanent center.

Mayor Gallego noted the State of Arizona also was preparing their budget and considering a flat income tax proposal which would decrease income tax revenues for cities and state shared revenue. She recognized the Arizona

League of Cities and Towns for their work on the City's behalf to ensure the State of Arizona understands the implications of the proposal.

CONSENT ACTION

This item is scheduled to allow the City Council to act on the Mayor's recommendations on the Consent Agenda. There was no Consent Agenda for this meeting.

CALL FOR AN EXECUTIVE SESSION

A vote may be held to call an Executive Session for a future date.

REPORTS AND BUDGET UPDATES BY THE CITY MANAGER

This item is scheduled to allow the City Manager to provide brief informational reports on topics of interest to the City Council. The City Council may discuss these reports but no action will be taken.

DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION (ITEM 1)

1 City Council Budget Decision on the 2021-22 Budget

Discussion

City Manager Ed Zuercher highlighted the importance of the budget given the status of state shared revenues. He stated the budget addressed City Council priorities and strategies and added important programs for the community. Mr. Zuercher introduced Budget and Research Director Amber Williamson and thanked her for her work along with City staff and Assistant City Manager Jeff Barton.

Ms. Williamson gave a high-level overview of the General Fund proposed additions and changes, as well as non-General Fund proposed additions. She highlighted the next steps and noted the property tax adoption on July 1, 2021 and recommended City Council approval of the 2021-22 budget.

Mayor Gallego thanked Ms. Williamson and opened the floor for public comment.

Andrea Odegard-Begay spoke in support of the budget notably for

climate change and heat readiness and diversity and inclusion programs.

Carol Olson spoke in support of the budget and the Crisis Assistance Program (CAP).

David Schwartz thanked staff, the Council, and Mayor Gallego for their work on the budget and expressed support for the budget particularly for pedestrian safety.

Susan Boyles spoke in support of public safety reform, the CAP, and noted the importance of providing behavioral health needs for the community.

Linda Brady expressed support for the budget allocated for Climate Change and Heat Readiness.

Timothy Brown spoke in support of the Climate Change and Heat Readiness program.

Lucia Corral expressed concerns about public transit connectivity for mothers and the elderly and advocated for a bus circulator in the 85046 zip code.

P.J. Dean expressed support for the budget and investment for CAP and advocated that the CAP remain in the Fire Department.

Sunshine Dean expressed support for the CAP to deliver critical mental and physical health services for the community.

Anne Ender spoke in support of the proposed budget and funds earmarked for police.

Patrick Graham expressed support for the Climate Change and Heat Readiness program and the Climate Action Plan and advocated for more investments in climate mitigation practices.

Leonard Gross expressed support for the proposed budget for the Climate Change and Heat Readiness program and the Office of Heat

Response and Mitigation.

Mike Huckins expressed support for the proposed budget especially for public safety and affordable housing.

Michelle Jameson spoke in support of the resources dedicated to mental and behavioral health.

Michael Kelly expressed support for the proposed budget and the expansion of the College Depot program and CAP.

Sommer Mattingly expressed support for the CAP and advocated the program maintain adequate funding to ensure long-term success.

Sandy Novelli spoke in support of the CAP.

David Obergfell expressed support for expanding resources for the CAP.

Michael Peel expressed support for the Climate Change and Heat Readiness program.

Jenny Poon advocated funds be used to invest in technology driven approaches to help businesses.

Jason Snead expressed support for the budget and the funds earmarked for the CAP.

Ginger Skye Torres spoke in support of the Climate Change and Heat Readiness initiatives, Office of Diversity and Inclusion, and the Food Action Plan.

Javier Torres thanked the Mayor, City Council, and staff for their work and expressed support for the Climate Change and Heat Readiness program.

Craig Tribken commended the City for trying new programs to address homelessness and advocated more programs be implemented.

Ashley Zafaranlou expressed support for the Climate Change and Heat Readiness program.

Stephanie Arreguin spoke in opposition to the CAP being located in public safety departments.

Luke Black expressed opposition to the budget due to the funds allocated for the Police Department; advocated the 75 new positions be taken away from the Police Department; and encouraged ARPA funds not be used for Police.

Kat Blue spoke in opposition to the budget due to the funds allocated for the Police Department and advocated funds be used for public safety reform.

Rebecca Denis expressed opposition to the budget due to funds allocated to the Police Department.

Blanca Abarca advocated street maintenance and investments be provided in all communities and spoke in opposition to the 75 positions allocated for the Police Department.

Martha Avendano asked the funds earmarked for 75 positions in the Police Department be used for free public transportation and rehabilitation centers instead.

Brenda Bustamante advocated funds from a block watch grant be awarded to the community in Estrella Village.

Eric Brickley expressed opposition to the proposed budget and advocated the Council implement Neighborhood-Organized Crisis Assistance Program (NOCAP) recommendations.

Ana Maria Calderon expressed opposition to the proposed budget and advocated the funds be used for libraries, community centers, parks, free public transit, and rehabilitation centers and advocated ARPA funds only be used for the community.

Alejandra Cervantes spoke in opposition to the budget due to the funds earmarked to the Police Department and advocated the funds be used for addiction and substance abuse and afterschool programs. She also requested ARPA funds only be used for the community.

Hava Derby expressed opposition to the proposed budget and advocated the CAP be fully funded separate from public safety.

Miros Domenzain spoke in opposition to the proposed budget and advocated funds be used for mental health services.

Joshua Ferrara expressed opposition to the proposed budget due to the funds earmarked for the Police Department and advocated funds be used for a fully independent crisis assistance program.

Cynthia Garcia spoke in opposition to the proposed budget due to the limited funds allocated to the CAP and advocated funds be used for a fully independent crisis assistance program.

Angelica Gastelum advocated for a community center and a library for Estrella Village.

Julie Gunnigle spoke in opposition to the proposed budget due to the funds earmarked for police and advocated the Council implement NOCAP recommendations.

Tom Gunnigle expressed opposition to the proposed budget due to the CAP being located in public safety.

Maria Gutierrez expressed opposition to the proposed budget due to the 75 positions allocated to the Police Department and advocated the funds be used for free transit instead.

Hana Hehman spoke in opposition of the CAP and the funds earmarked for 75 positions in the Police Department.

Viridiana Hernandez expressed opposition to the proposed budget due

to the 75 proposed positions allocated to the Police Department and advocated the funds from the 75 positions be used for the community.

Ana Laura Juarez spoke in opposition to the proposed budget due to the funds allocated to the Police Department and requested the funds be used to assist the community affected by COVID-19.

Yazmin Sagastume expressed opposition to the proposed budget due to the funds allocated to the 75 positions in the Police Department and advocated the funds from the positions be used for community programs.

Gladiela Lopez spoke in opposition to the proposed budget due to the funds allocated to the Police Department and advocated funds be used for the community.

Samuel Merten expressed opposition to the proposed budget due to the funds earmarked to the Police Department and asked the Council to implement a NOCAP program.

Christopher Martinez spoke in opposition to the proposed budget due to the funds allocated to the Police Department and advocated the Council to implement a NOCAP program and that labor negotiations be held publicly.

Amy Meglio expressed opposition to the proposed budget due to the lack of funds earmarked for CAP and advocated the Council to implement a NOCAP program.

Eric Elmore spoke in opposition to the proposed budget and asked the Council to implement a NOCAP program and defund the police.

Natividad Moreno expressed opposition to the proposed budget due to the 75 positions allocated to the Police Department and advocated funds be used to support community centers, free public transit, rehabilitation centers for individuals experiencing addiction and substance abuse, afterschool programs, and for undocumented members of the community.

Jacob Raiford spoke in opposition to the proposed budget due to the funds earmarked to the Police Department and CAP and advocated the City Council be more transparent and engage directly with the community and NOCAP.

Juana Rita expressed opposition to the budget due to the funds allocated for the 75 positions in the Police Department and advocated funds be used to free public transit, afterschool programs, rehabilitation centers for individuals experiencing addiction and substance abuse, and community centers.

Berta Rita advocated the Mayor and City Council change the start time of the Council meetings to accommodate working families and that funds in the budget be allocated to the community and away from police.

Ben Laughlin expressed opposition to the proposed budget due to the funds allocated for the 75 positions in the Police Department and advocated funds be used to support free public transit, afterschool programs, rehabilitation centers for individuals experiencing addiction and substance abuse, and community centers.

Maria Sanchez advocated the Mayor and Council improve virtual meeting technology and asked funds be taken away from the Police Department and invested back into the community.

Jessica Spencer spoke in opposition to the proposed budget due to the funds allocated to the Police Department and advocated funds be invested into the community.

Gerado Urbina expressed opposition to the proposed budget due to the funds allocated for the 75 positions in the Police Department and advocated funds be used to support community centers, afterschool programs, free public transit, and parks.

Aleida Urbina spoke in opposition to the proposed budget due to the funds allocated to the Police Department and advocated funds be used for free public transit, afterschool programs, and rehabilitation centers for

individuals experiencing addiction and substance abuse, and community centers.

Elizabeth Venable expressed opposition to the proposed budget due to the funds earmarked for the Police Department.

Sonia Velasquez spoke in opposition to the proposed budget due to the funds earmarked for 75 positions in the Police Department and advocated funds be used to support the community through free public transit, community centers, and rehabilitation centers.

Javier Villegas expressed opposition to the proposed budget due to the funds earmarked for 75 positions in the Police Department and advocated funds be used to support the community.

Dawn Augusta expressed support for the proposed CAP.

Ana Maria Hernandez advocated funds be allocated to Estrella Village for community centers, parks, libraries, and street and neighborhood maintenance.

Nanci Ibarra advocated funds be used to revitalize the Estrella Village community.

Brenda Montoya requested funds be used to implement electric buses and implement a free public transit circulator in Estrella Village.

Councilwoman Guardado made a motion to approve the proposed budget per staff's recommendation.

Councilwoman Ansari seconded the motion.

Vice Mayor Garcia thanked the public for their comments and advocated NOCAP ideas be considered moving forward while implementing the CAP and expressed support for a community/provider steering committee while the CAP program was developed. He requested a friendly amendment to fund the proposed 75 civilian Police Department positions through current vacant positions within the Police Department

and the \$3.2 million in savings could be used for Phoenix Afterschool Center (PAC) programs in Parks and Recreation and public transit.

Mayor Gallego asked City Attorney Cris Meyer if there should be a substitute motion or if a friendly amendment was sufficient.

Mr. Meyer responded the friendly amendment would be sufficient.

Councilwoman Guardado asked how many sworn Police positions would need to be eliminated to fund the 75 civilian positions.

Mr. Zuercher stated there were 3,125 authorized and funded sworn Police positions, and of those positions 2,934 positions were filled. Mr. Zuercher stated the Council authorized 3,125 police positions through their policies and goals over the last five years. He stated 35 police positions would need to be eliminated to equal \$3.2 million in savings, per the Vice Mayor's friendly amendment.

Councilwoman Guardado stated she agreed with the friendly amendment.

Councilwoman Ansari asked if the positions could be recreated at a later date.

Mr. Zuercher responded that funding from the positions would be moved to other positions and the friendly amendment would reduce the Council's target goal of 3,125 police positions to approximately 3,090 positions.

Councilwoman Ansari asked if the cap could be increased in the future.

Mr. Zuercher replied that the City Council would need to vote to increase positions and identify new funds for the positions. He stated 22 positions were converted at no cost due to available funds in the budget. Mr. Zuercher explained the Council would pay for 53 civilian positions by eliminating approximately 35 sworn Police Officer positions.

Councilwoman Ansari agreed to the friendly amendment.

Councilwoman Stark spoke in opposition to the friendly amendment due

to rising crime rates.

Councilman DiCiccio asked if separate motions could be made at the same time.

Mr. Meyer stated the budget was before the Council as a whole item and could not be separated out.

Councilman DiCiccio spoke in opposition to the friendly amendment and the entire budget.

Councilwoman Guardado expressed support to fill vacant positions and advocated for a budget that would allow for residents to re-enter the workforce and fund childcare.

Mr. Zuercher clarified that the funds for the 3,125 officers did not just accumulate in an account but were used to pay for things such as overtime for Police and to replace Police vehicles.

Councilwoman Ansari supported allocating funds for community programs such as after school programs and free public transit.

Vice Mayor Garcia stated the friendly amendment would leave 141 positions for overtime and police needs. He advocated the funds be used for community programs and more resources for communities in need.

Councilwoman Pastor asked how long the police positions have been vacant.

Mr. Zuercher stated the Council target of 3,125 positions was implemented five years ago.

Ms. Williamson stated the last time 3,125 police positions were filled was in fiscal years 2009-10.

Mr. Zuercher gave an overview of Police hiring since the Great Recession up to the present Council target goal.

Councilwoman O'Brien expressed opposition to the friendly amendment and stated a silent majority support public safety and noted ongoing attrition challenges for the Police Department.

Councilman DiCiccio stated the Police Department was already underfunded, unable to meet the needs of the community, and faced low morale.

Councilwoman Ansari reiterated the 75 civilian positions would go to the Police Department and the funds from the vacant positions could be used to fund the community and support the residents.

A motion was made by Councilwoman Guardado, seconded by Councilwoman Ansari, to approve the proposed budget per staff's recommendation with Vice Mayor Garcia's friendly amendment that the 75 civilian positions in the Police Department be funded through vacant positions and the savings be used for Phoenix Afterschool Center (PAC) programs and public transit.

Yes: 4 - Councilwoman Ansari, Councilwoman Guardado, Councilwoman Pastor, Vice Mayor Garcia

No: 5 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman O'Brien, Councilwoman Stark, Councilman Waring, Mayor Gallego

The motion failed by a 5-4 vote.

Councilwoman Stark made a motion to approve the proposed budget per staff's recommendation.

Councilwoman O'Brien seconded the motion.

Prior to Councilman Waring's vote, he expressed his disapproval of the budget as funds were being diverted away from the City's core function of providing Police and Fire services.

Prior to Vice Mayor Garcia's vote, he expressed his support for various programs in the budget but noted his inability to continue to support funding the Police Department.

Prior to Mayor Gallego's vote, she expressed support for the budget's new programs and investments the community.

A motion was made by Councilwoman Stark, seconded by Councilwoman O'Brien, that this item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Yes:** 6 - Councilwoman Ansari, Councilwoman Guardado, Councilwoman O'Brien, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark and Mayor Gallego
- No:** 3 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilman Waring and Vice Mayor Garcia

Councilwoman Pastor left at 6:54 p.m.

Following the vote, Councilwoman Guardado thanked the community and staff and highlighted her support for various investments and programs in the budget.

Following the vote, Councilwoman Ansari expressed support for community investments outlined in the budget.

Mayor Gallego recessed the meeting at 7 p.m.

INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION (ITEM 2)

2 American Rescue Plan Proposed Strategic Plan - Update

Discussion

Mayor Gallego reconvened the meeting at 7:20 p.m.

Mr. Zuercher introduced the proposed American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA) plan and gave an overview of the funds and guiding principles.

Mr. Barton outlined current ARPA guidance, noting its eligible activities and ongoing changes. He outlined three main allocations for ARPA funds: community, City operations, and contingency. Mr. Barton provided an overview of the proposed community investment programs, including arts, business and employee assistance, mitigation and care of vulnerable populations, household and residential assistance, youth sports, recreation, education and after-school programs, Phoenix resilient food system, better health and community outcomes. He outlined the City operations programs, including infrastructure, technology, and capital needs, revenue replacement, administrative oversight, compliance, outreach, PPE/cleaning/sanitizing/testing, and vaccines. Mr. Barton finished by highlighting the contingency to address unexpected issues or provide additional resources to approved programs.

Councilwoman Stark thanked Mr. Barton and City staff for their work and noted the dire need to make repairs to the 27th Avenue Materials Recovery Facility.

Councilwoman Guardado thanked staff for their work and creativity and expressed support. She asked about percent changes and allocations to programs since the April 27, 2021 Work Study Session.

Mr. Barton replied the federal government changed the allocation from \$416 million to \$396 million and community investment would equate to 70 percent of the total funds.

Councilwoman Guardado requested ARPA funds be allocated to childcare, by expanding pre-k, and the Phoenix Afterschool Center (PAC) programs as well as school districts, and to assist airport employees. She requested more funds be allocated for arts and workforce development.

Mayor Gallego opened the floor for public comment.

Penny Allee Taylor advocated ARPA funds be used to work with the community and invest in infrastructure.

Linda Brady spoke in support of using ARPA funds for capital, infrastructure, utility assistance, and capital needs, especially for electric vehicles.

Aaron Rippenkroeger advocated ARPA funds be used to assist in the Phoenix Welcome Center.

Councilwoman Ansari thanked Mr. Barton and staff for their work. She expressed support for the small business workforce programs along the south-central light rail corridor. She asked how long the \$1 million would last for free public transit.

Mr. Barton stated the duration of funds would be dependent on how the Council crafted the programs and the programs need to be further developed.

Councilwoman Ansari encouraged ARPA funds be used for green streets, stormwater management, outreach for COVID-19 vaccinations and community testing, refugee and non-profit communities, and tuition assistance.

Vice Mayor Garcia advocated ARPA funds be used for the communities most impacted by COVID-19 through rent and utility assistance and flexible housing assistance, car repairs, and medical needs. He asked the City to diverge from infrastructure investments and advocated the City purchase hotels or develop long-term affordable housing by investing in an affordable housing trust fund. Vice Mayor Garcia requested funds be given to local non-profits and organizations and the City develop a permanent heat relief center.

Councilwoman Guardado requested a library be added to the John F. Long Family Resource Center and for laptops to be able to be checked

out to those in need.

Mr. Zuercher noted the Parks and Recreation Director was examining PAC programs at schools.

Mayor Gallego advocated for continued and new partnerships with regional partners to leverage ARPA funds to invest in the community for childcare, noted the importance of capital and infrastructure investments within the City and advocated funds be used to vaccinate the community.

This item was discussed.

ADJOURN

There being no further business to come before the Council, Mayor Gallego declared the meeting adjourned at 8:35 p.m.

For further information, please call the Management Intern, City Manager's Office at 602-262-4449.